

Attached list 4: Characterization of data from Furlan D (2010) review: articles from western countries

Authors	Diseases	Acup Frequency	Average daily dose	Total dose	Group	Number of participants	Pain before	Pain after	Effective rate
Kennedy, S (2008)4	Acute LBP	Once or twice a week, for 3 to 12 sessions	0.21	1.71	Acup.	23	56.2	27.3	51.4%
					Sham Acup (not inserted)	22	62.6	36.3	42.0%
Eisenberg, DM (2007)5	Acute LBP	10 times in 5 weeks	0.21	1.07	Acup or Physio or massage	296	17	7	58.8%
					Usual Care	148	18	5	72.2%
Itoh, K (2004)9	Chronic LBP	Retained 30 min. Once a week for three weeks	0.14	0.43	Acup	9	64	53.7	16.1%
					Superficial Trigger point group	9	65.6	48.2	26.5%
					Deep Trigger point group	9	65.6	33.1	49.5%
Ceccherelli, F (2001)10	Chronic LBP	8 sessions	0.00	0.00	(no this issue)				
Gunn, CC (1980)11	Chronic LBP	1 or 2 times a week, for 7.9 tims	0.21	1.69	(Need full text)				

Haake, M (2007)12	Chronic LBP	2 times per week, 5 weeks	0.3	1.4	Acup	387	67.7	48.6	28.2%
					Sham Acup (inserted)	387	67.8	51	24.8%
					Drugs, physical therapy	388	67.8	57.1	15.8%
Inoue, M (2006)13	Chronic LBP	once							
Witt, CM (2006)14	Chronic LBP	10 times for 3 months	0.18	1.79	Acup	1549			37%
					Control	1544			10%
					Non-randomized group	8537			
Itoh, K (2006)15	Chronic LBP	3 times per week for 3 weeks	0.43	5.14					
Brinkhaus (2006)16	Chronic LBP	Twice a week for 4 weeks, then once a week for 4 weeks	0.29	2.86	Acup	140	63.2	34.5	45%
					Sham acup (inserted)	70			35%
					Waiting list	74			10%
Giles, LG (2003)17	Chronic LBP	9 weeks			Medication	19	3.5	3.8	-8.6%
					Acup	18	4.3	5.1	-18.6%
					Chiropractic	32	5	2.5	50.0%

Sator-Katzenschlager SM (2004)18	Chronic LBP	Once week for 6 weeks	0.14	0.86	E-aricular acup.	31	8	2	75.0%
					Sham E-aricular acup.	30	8	6.2	22.5%
Chu, J (2004)19	Chronic LBP	(Unknown)			Monopolar EMG needle	12	3.8	3.9	-2.6%
					Superficial needling (not penetrated)	12	4.0	3.5	12.5%
					ETOIMS	12	3.5	2.3	34.3%
Cecherelli, F (2003)20	Chronic LBP	Once a week for 5 weeks or 10 weeks	0.14	1.43	(Methodolodry test)				
Meng, CF (2003)21	Chronic LBP	Twice a week for 5 weeks, retain for 20 min.	0.29	2.86	E-Acup	24	9.8		42%
					Conventional	23	9.8		7.1%
Kerr, P (2003)22	Chronic LBP	once a week, for 6 weeks. retain 30 min.	0.14	0.86	Acup.	30	79.7	57.3	28.1%
					Sham-TENS	30	76	61.7	18.8%
Yeung, KN (2003)23	Chronic LBP	3 times a week for 4 weeks	0.43	5.14	E-Acup + exercise	26	6.38	3.81	40.3%
					Exercise	26	5.88	5.12	12.9%

Molsberger, AF (2002)24	Chronic LBP	12 times, for 6 weeks	0.29	3.43	Acup +COT				65%
					Sham Acup + COT	174			34%
					COT along				43%
Leibing, E (2002)25	Chronic LBP	Five times a week, and in the next 10 weeks once a week. Retained 30 min.	0.71	8.57	Acup + Physiol	40			56.3%
					Sham Acup (inserted) + Physiol	45			39.6%
					Physiocal	46			18.5%
Carlsson, CPO (2001)26	Chronic LBP	once a week, for 8 weeks	0.14	1.14	E-Acup	34	57	43	18.5%
					Sham TENS (not connected)	16			0%
Cherkin, DC (2001)27	Chronic LBP	10 times for 10 weeks	0.14	1.43	Acup	94	6.2	4	35.5%
					Massage	78	6.2	3.6	41.9%
					Self Care	90	6.1	4.6	24.6%
Grant, DJ (1999)28	Chronic LBP	Twice a week, 4 week	0.29	2.29	Acup.	32	140	71	49.3%
					TENS	28	101	47	53.5%
Lehmann, TR (1983)29	Chronic LBP	Twice a week, for 3 weeks	0.29	1.71	E-Acup	17	(Data not available)		
					TENS	18			
					TENS-no battery	18			

MacDonald, AJR (1983)30	Chronic LBP	Once a week, for 10 times	0.14	1.43	TENS	8	57.15%			
					Sham TENS	9	22.74%			
Mendelson, G (1983)31	Chronic LBP	Twice a week, 4 weeks	0.29	1.14	Acup	26%				
					Placebo	22%				
Coan, R (1980)32	Chronic LBP					(Data not available)				
Mendelson, G (1978)33	Chronic LBP	Twice a week, 4 weeks	0.29	1.14	Acup	55%				
					Placebo	55%				
Hollisaz, MT (2008)38	Chronic LBP	Retain 20 min, once every other day for one month (15 times)	0.5	7.5	E-Acup	41	62.1%			
					Physiol	38	52.5%			
					Sham E-Acup (not inserted)	40	17.5%			
Takeda, H (2001)39	Chronic LBP	6 times					In Japanese?			
Sakai, T (1998)40	Chronic LBP	4 time in 2 weeks					In Japanese?			
Itoh, K (2009)42	Chronic LBP	Once a week, for 5 weeks,	0.14	0.71	Acup.	8	60	37.4	37.7%	
					TENS	6	63.8	53.2	16.6%	
					Acup + TENS	6	62.3	36.6	41.3%	

					Control	7	63.7	53.1	16.6%
Yuan, J (2009)43	Chronic LBP	2 times per week, for 5 week. Or 5 times per week for 2 week.	0.29	1.43	Acup (Twice a week for 5 weeks)	30	4.3	1.23	71.4%
			0.71	7.14	Acup (5 sessions a week for 2 weeks)	30	3.98	1.03	74.1%
Cherkin, DC (2009)44	Chronic LBP	Retain 20 min. Twice a week for 3 weeks, then once a week for 4 weeks	0.29	2.29	Individual Acup.	157	5	3.4	32.0%
					St. Acup.	158	5	3.3	34.0%
					Sham (Not inserted)	162	4.9	3	38.8%
					Regular care	161	11	8.9	19.1%
Not yet screened (2005)45	Chronic LBP	In Japanese?							
Thomas, M (1994)47	Chronic LBP	Twice a week for 10 sessions	0.29	2.86	Acup	7	5.5	4	27.3%
					LF-E-Acup	9	5.3	2.5	52.8%
					HF E-Acup	11	8.1	6.2	23.5%
					Waiting list	10	6.2	6.4	-3.2%
Inoue, M (2001)49	Chronic LBP	In Japanese?							
Ratcliffe, J (2006)93	Mixed LBP	10 times over 3 months	0.11	1.11	(This is to compare cost-effectiveness)				
Tsukayama, H (2002)94	Mixed LBP	Twice a week, for 2 weeks	0.29	1.14	E-Acup	10	100	56	44.0%

					TENS	10	100	72	28.0%
Sakai, T (2001)95	Mixed LBP	4 sessions over 2 weeks	0.29	1.14	in Japanese?				
Thomas, KJ (2006)97	Mixed LBP	10 sessions over 3 months	0.11	1.11	Acup	159	33.7	20.6	38.9%
					General care	80	31.4	19.6	37.6%
Lee, J (2007)100	Mixed LBP	5 times a week, for 3 weeks	0.71	10.71	In Korea				
Garvey, TA (1989)101	Mixed LBP	One time							
Mencke (1988)102	Mixed LBP	6 times over 3 weeks	0.29	1.71	In Germany				
Inoue, M (2001)103	Mixed LBP	One time							
Kurosu, Y (1979)104	Mixed LBP				In Japanese				
Edelist, G (1976)105	Mixed LBP	Once every 2 days for 3 sessions	0.50	1.50	E- Acup	No pain scale reported			
					Sham (Inserted-with Electric)				
Kawase, Y (2006)106	Mixed LBP	One time			In Japanese				
Aigner, N (1999)196	Acute neck pain	Did not mention			In Germany				

Venancio RA (2008)197,198	This is for headache	for 3 weeks			Acup		0.52	0.34	34.6%
					lidocaine injection in triger point		0.6	0.4	33.3%
					botulinum toxin, injection in triger point		0.44	0.33	25.0%
Ga, H (2007)199	Chronic neck pain	Once a week for 3 weeks	0.14	0.43	Acup	18	6.98	3.82	45.3%
					Trigger point- lidocaine injection	21	6.43	3.46	46.2%
Ga, H (2007)200	Chronic neck pain	Once a week for 3 weeks	0.14	0.43	Trigger point	18	3.5	2.1	40.0%
					Trigger point + Jia ji points	22	3.5	1.6	54.3%
Irnich D [crossover] (2002)202,203	Chronic neck pain	One time			This is to compare distance Acupuncture, Triger point Acup and laser Sham.				
Zhu XM [crossover] (2002)204	Chronic neck pain	3 times per week for 3 weeks	0.43	3.86	E-Acup (15-25HZ)	14	51.8	28.9	44.2%
					Sham E-Acup (with electric stimulation)	15	40.3	21.1	47.6%

Irnich D (2001)205-207	Chronic neck pain	5 times over 3 weeks	0.24	1.19	Acup with ear Acup, trigger point	56	54.15	44.7%	
					Massage	60	54.71	14.5%	
					Laser Sham	61	57.15	30.2%	
White, PF (2000)208	Chronic neck pain	30 min, 3 times per week for 3 wk	0.43	3.86	Acup			9.0%	
					Local TENS			38.0%	
					Remote TENS			13.0%	
Lundeburg (1991)209		(Data not available, not clinic study?)							
Cecchereli F (2006)210	Chronic neck pain	8 times over 4 weeks?	0.29	2.29	Acup.	31	40.7	13.32	67.3%
					Acup + Ear Acup.	31	38.9	13.43	65.5%
Thomas, M (1991)211	Chronic neck pain	(Did not indicate)			Acup.	44	3.5	2.3	34.3%
					Sham Acup (Inserted)	44	3.1	2.4	22.6%
					Diazepam	44	3	2.2	26.7%
					Sham Diazepam	44	2.7	2.2	18.5%
Abernathy, AP (2008)214					This is a review paper				
Itoh, K (2007)215	Chronic neck pain	once a week for 6 weeks	0.14	0.86	Acup.	8	69.5	51.6	25.8%
					Trigger pain Acup.	8	67	11	83.6%

					Non-trigger point Acup	8	70.9	57.6	18.8%
					Sham Acup. (Not inserted)	7	64.1	53.9	15.9%
Salter GC (2006)216	Chronic neck pain	10 times over 3 months	0.12	1.19	Acup.	10	34.31	22.73	33.8%
					General Care	14	38.44	25.72	33.1%
Seidel (2002)217218	Chronic neck pain	8 times over 4 weeks	0.29	2.29	no this issue				
Petrie, J (1986)219	Chronic neck pain	Twice weekly for 4 weeks	0.29	2.29	Acup	13	47.08	36.59	22.3%
					TENS sham	12	31.67	32.88	-3.8%
Petrie, JP (1983)220	Chronic nec pain	8 times over 4 weeks	0.29	2.29	no this issue				
Gallacchi G (1983)221,222	Chronic neck pain	8 times over 4 weeks	0.29	2.29	In Germany				
Coan RM (1981)223	Chronic neck pain	3-4 times per week for 8 weeks	0.50	14.00	Aup.	40.0%			
					Control	13.0%			
Giles, LGF (1999)129	Chronic neck pain	6 times over 4 weeks	0.21	1.29	Chiropractic	32	4.5	33.3%	
					E-Acup	18	2	50.0%	

					Nonsteroidal anti-inflammatory medication	19	4		42.5%
David, J (1998)224	Chronic neck pain	6 times over 6 weeks	0.14	0.86	Acup.		50	30	40.0%
					Physiol therapy		50	22	56.0%
Vas, J (2006)225	Chronic neck pain	5 times over 3 weeks, retain 30 min each time.	0.24	1.19	Acup. + Ear Acup.	61	68.7	44.1	64.2%
					Sham (TENS)	62	72.3	12.3	17.0%
White P (2004)226,227	Chronic neck pain	8 times over 4 weeks, retention for 20 min.	0.29	2.29	Acup.	70	49.6	16.71	66.3%
					Sham (TENS)	65	54.11	28.2	47.9%
Sator-Katzenschlager SM (2003)228	Chronic neck pain	Once a week for 6 weeks	0.14	0.86	Auricular Acup	10			
					E- Auricular Acup	11			
Nabeta, T (2002)229	Chronic neck pain	Once a week for 3 weeks	0.14	0.43	Acup	17	60.5	43.3	28.4%
					Sham Acup (No inserted)	17	48.8	46.8	4.1%
Chu J (1997)235	Chronic neck pain				(This is basic study, no VAS scales)				

Edwards J (2003)246	Chronic neck pain	4.6 treatment over 3 weeks	0.22	1.01	Superficial needling on trigger point + stretching	14	24.3	13	46.5%
					Stretching	13	23.1	17.1	26.0%
					No treatment	13	20.2	16.5	18.3%